Assessment of Adherence to Antiretroviral Therapy among Adult People Living with HIV/AIDS in North East, Ethiopia

Almaz Mengistie 1*
Adugnaw Birhane 1
Esubalew Tesfahun 2

1Department of Public Health, Medicine and Health Science Institute, College of Health Science, Debre Berhan University, Ethiopia
2School of Public Health, College of Health Science, Addis Ababa University, Ethiopia

Abstract

Background: The scale-up of anti-retroviral treatment is among the greatest successes of the global Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndromes (AIDS) response to date and it is on a Fast-Track approach. To contribute to the global and local target of HIV/AIDS response as well as to obtain full benefits of ART medication, strong adherence of ≥95% to Anti-Retroviral Therapy (ART) is needed.

Methods: A cross-sectional study among 352 and 20 study participants for quantitative and for in-depth interview respectively. Data was collected using semi-structured questionnaire with a face-to-face interview for quantitative and interview guide for the in-depth interview. Bivariate and Multivariable logistic analysis was applied to examine the association between the dependent and independent variables. Additionally, thematic analysis, interpretation and triangulation of the finding were done for in-depth-interview.

Results: A total of 352 people living with HIV/AIDS were responded to the study with 90% response rate. Of the total 352 respondents 87.2% were adherent and the overall adherence level was found to be 95%. The study revealed factors associated to adherence to ART were marital status (AOR: 4.4; 95% CI: 1.3-14.7), use of memory aids (AOR: 6.5; 95% CI: 2.6-16.2) Living condition (AOR: 2.9; 95% CI: 1.1-7.6), Experienced side effect (AOR: 4.6; 95% CI: 1.9-11.3), drug regimen (AOR: 5.5; 95% CI: 1.4-22.3) and distance in km (AOR: 2.7; 95% CI: 1.11-6.4).

Conclusion: Patient counselling, health education and health system strengthening are very important for improvement of ART drug adherence.

Keywords: Adherence, Acquire, Immunodeficiency, Retroviral, Syndromes, Treatment.

Introduction

Adherence to an ARV treatment regimen involves taking all pills in the correctly prescribed doses, at the right time, and in the right way. To achieve the global and local target of HIV/AIDS response, strong adherence to Anti-Retroviral Therapy (ART) is needed to obtain full benefits of ART medication. The global Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndromes (AIDS) response to date and it is on a Fast-Track-Strategy scale-up of anti-retroviral treatment is among the greatest successes. Its goal is to achieve and sustain viral suppression. Even though its roll-out has led to a massive reduction in AIDS-related deaths, viral suppression rates are still too low to realize the prevention role of treatment. In some
settings, the early initiation of ART may place demands on
the health system that could increase the risk of drug
resistance, drug stock-outs, insufficient patient preparation
and suboptimal adherence [1-3].

Long-term adherence to treatment is critical for the
success of ART and presents new challenges. Adherence
to ART is a primary determinant of viral suppression and
transmission risk, disease progression and death. In all
regions suboptimal adherence is a major challenge, at all
stages of HIV disease, and is associated with a diversity
of patient- and program-related challenges. Study has
suggested that when adherence rates are between 50% and
85%, drug resistance is more likely to develop [2-5].

The evidence in different countries and settings has shown
that sub optimal level of adherence and non-adherence to
ART are the most common reasons for treatment failure and
call for additional assessment and intervention.

The reasons for poor health outcomes and increased
health care costs may be as a result of poor adherence to long-
term therapies. It severely compromises the effectiveness
of treatment making this a critical issue in public health both
difficulty from the perspective of quality of life and of health economics
[6]. It is the most common cause of treatment failure. Due to
cross-resistance, the virus can become resistant to an entire
class of ARVs thereby rendering that class ineffective not
just for the individual but also for the society. This can lead
to change of treatment regimen to more expensive second-
line drug [7-9]. Adherence is increasingly understood as a
dynamic behaviour influenced by a matrix of interrelated
factors that change over time and periodic assessment is
recommended. Additionally, the rapid scale up and current
early initiation of ART may be associated with an increase
in HIV drug resistance in the population, if appropriate
assessment and prevention measures are not taken.

Because this early initiation leads people to start before
they are ready, with adverse consequences for adherence
and treatment outcomes. Because of these, evaluation of
adherence was recommended in the literature in order to
develop appropriate adherence interventions [2].

In order to implement appropriate intervention aimed
to improve adherence, the discovery of factors for non-
adherence to ART could help guide new public health
policies and aid in developing more effective prevention
strategies. In spite of the high non-adherence rate, there
is very little information on the factors for these non-
adherences. Thus, this study was conducted with an aim to
assess the recent level of adherence to ART and investigate
determinant factors. This study was conducted with an aim
to assess the recent level of adherence to ART and investigate
factors associated with adherence to ART medication using
mixed method approach. Therefore, the result of this
research project will have a paramount importance for the
improvement of ART drug adherence intervention.

Therefore, the result of this research project will have a
paramount importance for the improvement of ART drug
adherence intervention.

Methods

Study area and period

The study was conducted from February to April, 2018 at
ART units in Debre Berhan Kebele Health Centre and Debre
Berhan Referral Hospital. These two health institutions are
the only public health facilities in the town currently giving
ART service. According to the data from the two health
facilities, there were a total of 2,644 adult patients actively
following ART therapy in both health facilities (1,864 at the
hospital and 780 at the health centre).

Study design and data collection

An institutional based cross-sectional quantitative study
supported by qualitative approach was conducted. The
data was collected using a standardized semi-structured
questionnaire adopted from the World Health Organization
(WHO) by directly interviewing study participants and
gathering relevant information from their records. In
addition, unstructured one-on-one in-depth interviews using

The sample sizes for this study are 276 and 115 from the hospital
and health centre respectively.

Analysis

Self-reported adherence was classified as being
“adherent” when not even a single dose is missed corresponds
to dose adherence. If the patient admitted having missed at
least one dose corresponds to non-adherence. Adherence
measurement of 95% or more is classified as adherent and
less than 95% is classified as having non-adherence.

Therefore, self-report of four-day recall adherence rates
measured as proportion using the formula:

\[
\text{Adherence rate} = \frac{\text{Number of pills (doses) taken}}{\text{doses prescribed or supposed to be taken}} \times 100\%
\]

Descriptive statistics such as percentages, means,
and standard deviations were calculated to describe and
the data was also summarized in tables and graphs. To
examine the relationship between levels of adherence
and the independent variables, the bivariate and multivariable
logistic regression analysis was carried out. The outcome
ART adherence variable is dichotomized and defined as
0= none adherents to ART; 1= adherents to ART. Each
independent variable was tested with the adherence
status for the association. Thematic analysis was used for
qualitative data. Interpreted and triangulation of the finding
with quantitative finding was done and presented in text.

Results

Socio demographic characteristics

A total of 352 adult patients living with HIV/AIDS on first
line ART were included in the study with the response rate of
90%. More than two third 249 (70.7%) of the respondents were
females and the mean age of the respondents was 36.9 ±10.6 years.
Information regarding psycho social conditions

When the respondents asked about their living condition 242(68.8%) of them were living with their families (spouse or children). Regarding their disclosure status, 307(87.2%) were disclosed their sero status to their families, but only 134(38.1%) of the total respondents were disclosed their HIV status to the communities. About half 85(52.6%) of respondents reported they have discomfort of taking medication in front of others.

Information regarding the clinical condition of the patient

About half of the patients 166(51%) had base line CD4 count less than 200 but 210 (68%) of the participants had current CD4 count greater than 350. The initial WHO clinical stage was stage III for 131(37.3%) patients and the current WHO stage, for more than three fourth 336(95.5%) of the respondents one was T1 (Table 1).

Drug related

Of respondents on medication 194(55%) were taking one pill of ART once daily and the rest were taking twice during the study period. About 273 (77.9%) of them reported that the schedule was convenient and easy to fit to their daily routine, but the rests found it was inconvenient and difficult to fit to their daily routine (Table, 2).

ART adherence level and reasons for missing their treatment

Regarding the adherence assessment to ARV therapy using missed dose self-report medication adherence

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>N (%)</th>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>N (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Duration of infection (n=352)</td>
<td>Current CD4 count (n=310)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37+month</td>
<td>272(77.3)</td>
<td>&lt;200</td>
<td>35(11.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25-36month</td>
<td>23(6.5)</td>
<td>200-350</td>
<td>65(21)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13-24month</td>
<td>31(8.8)</td>
<td>&gt;350</td>
<td>210 (67.7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-12months</td>
<td>267(7.4)</td>
<td>Initial WHO stage (n=351)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| How health described (n=352) | |
| Better | 268(76.1) |
| Same | 73(20.7) |
| Worse | 11(3.1) |
| Initial viral load (n=13) | Current WHO clinical stage (n=352) | |
| <1000 | 1(7.7) |
| >1000 | 129(2.3) |
| Current viral load (n=243) | Stage T1 | 336(95.5) |
| <1000 | Stage T2 | 10(2.8) |
| >1000 | Stage T3 | 6(1.7) |
| Initial CD4 (n=327) | |
| <200 | 166(50.8) |
| 200–350 | 92(28.1) |
| >350 | 69(21.1) |

Table 1: The clinical condition and clinical marker of respondents in Debre Berhan Health Centre and Debrebrahan Referral Hospital, North East Ethiopia, 2018.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>N (%)</th>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>N (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ART drug regimen (n=352)</td>
<td>Experience the side effects of ART (n=352)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AZT-3TC-NVP</td>
<td>79(22.4)</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>96(27.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AZT-3TC-EFV</td>
<td>33(9.4)</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>256(72.7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TDF-3TC-NVP</td>
<td>40(11.4)</td>
<td>Symptoms experienced (n=96)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TDF-3TC-EFV</td>
<td>194(55.1)</td>
<td>Nausea &amp; vomiting</td>
<td>11(11.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of pills used each time (n=352)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One</td>
<td>273(77.6)</td>
<td>Pain and numbness</td>
<td>5(5.2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>two</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>Head ache</td>
<td>43(44.8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>one or two</td>
<td>79(22.4)</td>
<td>Fatigue</td>
<td>8(8.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequency used per day (n=352)</td>
<td>Depression</td>
<td>4(4.2)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Once</td>
<td>194(55.1)</td>
<td>Abdominal pain</td>
<td>10(10.4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Twice</td>
<td>158(44.9)</td>
<td>Others</td>
<td>7(6.2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duration on art in months (n=352)</td>
<td>Schedule fitting daily life (n=352)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-12 months</td>
<td>51(14.5)</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>273(77.6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13-24months</td>
<td>33(9.4)</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>79(22.4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23-36months</td>
<td>331(51.3)</td>
<td>Special instructions given? (n=352)</td>
<td>344(97.7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt;37+months</td>
<td>215(61.1)</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>344(97.7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adherence to the given adherence instructions (n=344)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>336(97.7)</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>8(2.3)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2: Drug related information of respondents in Debrebrahan Health Centre and Debrebrahan Referral Hospital, North East Ethiopia, 2018.
The association of health system related factor also indicated patients who came from nearby places (<5km or less) were 2.5 times more (COR: 2.5; CI: 1.3-5; P=0.006) in bivariate analysis.

Selective variables were entered simultaneously into multivariate logistic regression to identify the most independent predictor variables of ART adherence. Accordingly, the result showed that, married patients on ART were 3 times more (AOR: 3.2; CI: 1.06-9.9; P=0.039) adherent than singles (Table 3).

Similarly, the in-depth interview indicated that, married people and patients who use memory aids were adherent due to the support and encouragement given from the spouse and family members as reported below.

“I never miss my medication because I use mobile alarm as a reminder. In addition to that, even though my husband’s sero status is negative, he supports and encourages me to stick to my medication schedule.” (A 28 years old house wife female Patient from the Hospital).

Responses from the in-depth interviews with patients however indicated different findings. Some of them indicated that, alcohol consumption and being busy with social events were the reasons of forgetfulness to take their medication properly and influence adherence.

Factors associated with medication adherence

The association of factors to medication adherence is reported in the tables (Table 3). Variables like age, gender, monthly income, active substance use, WHO clinical staging, CD4 count drug regimen and others variables were not associated with medication adherence.

Patients whose current viral load <1000 copies/µL were 11 times more (COR:10.9; CI: 4.5-26.6; P<0.0001 ),those who had side effects of ART drug 0.2 times less (COR: 0.193; CI: 0.01-0.37;P<0.0001) likely were adherence to ART than their counter parts using bivariate analysis.

Table 3: Bivariate and multivariate analysis of adherence and socio demographic variables of respondents in Debrebrhan Health Centre and Debrebrhan Referral Hospital, North East Ethiopia, 2018.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Non adherent</th>
<th>Adherent</th>
<th>COR(95%CI)</th>
<th>AOR(95%CI)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>36(12.7%)</td>
<td>247(87.3%)</td>
<td>1(0.47-2.25)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&lt;45years</td>
<td>9(13%)</td>
<td>60(87%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residence of participant</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>29(9.8%)</td>
<td>266(90.1%)</td>
<td>3.6(1.8-7.2)*</td>
<td>1.8(0.717-4.6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>16(28.1%)</td>
<td>41(71.9%)</td>
<td>3.6(1.8-7.2)*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital status</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Married</td>
<td>16(8.9%)</td>
<td>163(91.1%)</td>
<td>3.2(1.4-7.5)*</td>
<td>3.2(1.06-9.9)*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Divorced</td>
<td>8(10.8%)</td>
<td>66(89.2%)</td>
<td>2.6(0.96-7.04)</td>
<td>3.6(0.923-14.1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Widowed</td>
<td>6(13.3%)</td>
<td>39(86.7%)</td>
<td>2(0.68-6.10)</td>
<td>1.6(0.33-7.44)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Separate</td>
<td>4(50.0%)</td>
<td>4(50%)</td>
<td>0.3(0.07-1.47)</td>
<td>1.1(0.089-13.1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single</td>
<td>11(23.9%)</td>
<td>35(76.1%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Occupational status</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>House Servant</td>
<td>1(20%)</td>
<td>4(80%)</td>
<td>0.44(0.36-4.7)</td>
<td>3.6(0.154-84.6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daily Laborer</td>
<td>14(11.6%)</td>
<td>107(88.4%)</td>
<td>0.8(0.51-8.3)</td>
<td>2.10(0.51-8.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td>5(41.7%)</td>
<td>7(58.3%)</td>
<td>0.16(0.04-0.65)*</td>
<td>0.22(0.024-2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farmer</td>
<td>9(15%)</td>
<td>51(85%)</td>
<td>0.6(0.209-1.9)</td>
<td>8.8(0.905-86.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>House wife</td>
<td>4(13.3%)</td>
<td>26(86.7%)</td>
<td>0.7(0.187-2.8)</td>
<td>1(0.14-7.4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Merchant</td>
<td>6(9.4%)</td>
<td>58(58%)</td>
<td>0.7(0.187-2.8)</td>
<td>1.7(0.36-8.11)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Govt employee</td>
<td>6(10%)</td>
<td>54(90%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational status</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educated</td>
<td>20(9.7%)</td>
<td>186(90.3%)</td>
<td>1.9(1.02-3.6)*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not educated</td>
<td>25(17.1%)</td>
<td>121(82.9%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table measurement, 307(87.2%) of all participants interviewed were adherent to the dose, and the rests 45(12.8%) were missed at least one dose in the last four days prior to the survey. The overall mean adherent level was 95±14 in this study area. Of non-adherents, 37(82.2%) of the study participant missed two doses (Table 3). The primary reasons reported by participants for treatment non-adherence were 15(33.3%) due to simply forgotten, 12(26.7%) being away from home, being busy 7(15.6%).

The primary reasons reported by participants for treatment non-adherence were 15(33.3%) due to simply forgotten, 12(26.7%) being away from home, being busy 7(15.6%).

Findings from in-depth interview also indicated that forgetfulness was mentioned by participants as barrier to adherence.

During the in-depth interview some patients forget their appointment dates and the dose of medication when they go to holy water and think of other spiritual and religious practice.

Example A 45 year old male government employee said:-
In this study we tried to assess the level of adherence and factors associated with HAART adherence in Debre Berhan Health Centre and Debre Berhan Referral Hospital, from February to April 2018.

Of the total respondents 87.2% of individuals has adherence level of > 95% to their ART drugs while 12.7% of them were non-adherent (<95%) and this finding is consistent with (61.8%,62.8%,75.4%,74.2%,63.8%,83.1%,8 6%,95.5%) studies done in Tawan Mai, an outpatient clinic, Taksin Hospital, Bangkok in Thailand, in Keffi, Nigeria , in Ibadan, Nigeria, Yirgalem hospital, Jimma University, in Bale Robe and Ambo [10-16]. However it is lower than the finding (97.9%, 90%) of study conducted in South Eastern Nigeria, and Lagos Islan Nigeria [17,18]. And higher than (62.3%, 69%, 43.2%, 48.2%, 86%, 85.3%) Review study done in Africa 2014, studies done in Thailand (2010), Eldorate Kenya, Emu Kenya, Ghana and South Gondar ≥95% adherence rate respectively [18-24]. This variation observed in different location may have different reasons, for example, It could be related to the heterogeneity in measurement methods since there is no consensus exists about the gold standard measurement of adherence

Regarding psychosocial findings using bivariate analysis this study found that patients who disclosed their sero status to the family and community were 4.6 times higher likely adhered than not. On the other hand, patients who felt discomfort of taking medication in front of others were 0.5 times less likely to adhere than their counter parts in bivariate analysis. This finding is in line with the study conducted in Nigeria kefi, Ambo, Emmu Kenya and Bale Robe [11,15,16,22].

In bivariate logistic regression analysis disclosure of HIV status to the family member shown 3.5 times more adherent than their counter parts similar other finding in which Respondent who disclosed their sero status to at least one person were 3.5 times more likely to be HAART adherent than those respondent who did not disclose their sero status [16]. This is the same as finding in qualitative study. However, in the multivariate analysis no association was found which is similar with study in Mekele [25].

Using bivariate analysis and from in-depth interview Patients who got family support were more likely adhered than their counterparts which is consistent with studies in Diredawa and Harer [26].In this study the individuals who had support from the family was found to be 3.2 times likely to adhere in bivariate analysis. Similarly, findings in, Bale Robe, Gana, Jimma, North west Ethiopia and Diredawa also are in agreement with our finding [14,15,24,26]. But in current study support was not significantly associated with adherence in the multivariate analysis and similar with study in Yirgalem, Bale robe, Gana and Diredawa [15,23,26,27]. This disappearance might be due to the effect of confounders.

This study also found that, patients who use memory aids like mobile, watch or other means of reminders were 6 times more likely to adherent than those who did not in bivariate and multivariate analysis but the odd of adherent in multivariate was decreased to 5. Our finding is not consistent with the finding from Nigeria which has shown the use of memory aids was not associated with medication adherence [11]. But it was in agreement with the study that revealed the use of reminder tools are factors that influence adherence to ART and with current in-depth interview [28].

In this study current study there was association of current viral load with adherence, but no association was found between adherence and duration of infection, WHO clinical stage, base line CD4, current CD4 and baseline viral load. In contrary to this, baseline CD4 count of <350 cells/ml were significantly associated predictors of ART adherence as shown in Oromia [29]. Longer time between HIV infection and AIDS had an important problem within the first six months of HAART adherence [30].

Generally, in the current study we identified that memory aids, marital status, side effect of medication and frequency of adherence to instruction were the main predictors of adherent to medication.

**Conclusion**

Adherence level and certain important factors affecting adherence of patients have been explored and identified in this study.

The level of adherence to ART was relatively higher when compared to other studies done in Ethiopia and other developing countries but it is below the recommended level (≥95%) and multiple determinants of adherence were identified which needs to be addressed. The most frequently reported reason for non-adherence were forgetting, went away from home, being busy with other things and do not want others to notice. The use of memory aids and being marred were found to be independent positive predictors for drug adherence whereas medication side effect and adherence instruction were the negative predictors for medication adherence. Additionally, ART dug stock out, long waiting time, use of alternative and traditional medicines, desire to live longer and fear of stigma and discrimination, were the findings reported as barriers to adherence

**Funding**

The author disclosed receipt of the following financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article: We are grateful to the Debre Berhan University for financial and logistic support.

**Authors’ Contribution**

All authors involved in preparing the proposal, analyses of the results and writing the final manuscript.
Availability of Data and Material

The data set used for this study are available from the corresponding author at reasonable request.

Competing Interests

The authors declare that they have no competing interests.

Ethics Approval and Consent to Participate

Written consent was obtained from the Debre Berhan University (DBU) Health Science College and Debre Berhan town city admiration. Verbal consent obtained from each respondent. The confidentiality of the respondent respected throughout the procedures.

Acronyms and List of Abbreviations

- 3TC: Lamivudine
- ABC: Abacavir
- AIDS: Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
- ART: Antiretroviral Therapy
- D4T: Stavudine
- DOT: Directly Observed Treatment
- EFV: Efavirenz
- LPV/r: Lopinavir/Ritonavir
- MEMS: Medication Event Monitoring System
- NNRTI: Non-Nucleoside Reverse-Transcriptase Inhibitor
- NRTIs: Nucleoside Reverse Transcriptase Inhibitors
- NVP: Neverapine
- PI: Protease Inhibitors
- PITT: Pill Identification Test
- TDF: Tenofovir Disoproxil Fumarate
- TDM: Therapeutic Drug Monitoring
- VAS: Visual Analogue Scale
- ZDV: Zidovudine

References


